MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF CIRCLE RELAXATION COMMITTEE HELD FOR
CONSIDERATION OF CASES UNDER COMPASSIONATE APPOINTMENT IN
MAHARASHTRA CIRCLE

The Circle Relaxation Committee (CRC) was constituted vide memo no. ADR/CRC/Deptl/2015-16-2016-17 dated 23.07.2018, with the following members:

1. Dr.N.Vinod Kumar  PMG Goa  Chairman
2. Ms.Kaiya Arora  DPS MR  Member
3. Shri Pawan Kumar Dalmia  DPS Nagpur  Member

The Circle Relaxation Committee met on 01.08.2018, 02.08.2018, 09.08.2018 and 10.08.2018 in Conference Room O/o Chief PMG, Maharashtra Circle, Mumbai 400 001.

2. The Committee was informed that the last CRC held on 13.05.2016 considered all applications received till 31.12.2014. Further, the Committee was informed that 222 applications were received at Circle Office during the period from 01.01.2015 to 31.03.2017. There are 22 old cases which could not be considered by the last CRC for want of certain supporting documents. These 244 applications and 6 applications, earlier considered and rejected by the CRC and now ordered to be re-considered by Hon’ble CAT, were placed before the Committee.

The breakup of the cases is as below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.No.</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>No. of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pending cases of last CRC for want of documents/compliance.</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cases received between 01.01.2015 and 31.03.2017</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Cases ordered by Hon’ble CAT for re-examination/reconsideration</td>
<td>06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Out of 250 cases, following 3 applicants withdrew their claims with request to consider the application of their relatives/kin as below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Case No.</th>
<th>Old Applicant</th>
<th>New Applicant</th>
<th>Remark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>RE/4-3/45/07</td>
<td>Mangesh S. Jadhav (Son)</td>
<td>Priti S. Jadhav (Daughter)</td>
<td>Fresh case yet to be received.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>RE/4-</td>
<td>Shri Shailesh</td>
<td>Applicant expired.</td>
<td>Fresh case yet to be</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These applications when received may be placed before the next CRC.

4. As per the Department of Posts Memo No. 14014/3/2005.Estt (D) dated 14.06.2006, 5% of total vacancies arising for the Direct Recruitment Quota is only to be reserved for Relaxation cases under different cadres. Committee was informed of the vacancy position as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadre</th>
<th>Number of Vacancies under Relaxation for the year 2015-16</th>
<th>Number of Vacancies under Relaxation for the year 2016-17</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PA/SA</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postman/Mail-Guard</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTS</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. The Committee followed instructions contained in Directorate memo no 37-36/2014-SPB-1/C dated 20.01.2010 for award of points based on eight parameters having a total of 100 points. In addition, where the widow of the deceased applied for herself, additional 15 points were given as grace points as per instructions contained in the said memo.

The committee scrutinized all the 247 cases in the light of various guidelines issued by the Department of Posts noted below.

V. Memo No 14014/02/2012 Estt(D) dated 16.01.2013, 30.05.2013 & 05.09.2016.

6. All 247 cases are listed in Annexure – I along with the merit points awarded on the basis of scrutiny of documents produced and verified.

The committee after going through relevant records/documents in case of each applicant and considering educational qualification recommended the following applicants against the available vacancies.
a. Postal Assistant and Sorting Assistant (36 vacancies) in Annexure II
b. Postman and Mail Guard (35 Vacancies) in Annexure III
c. Multi-Tasking Staff (29 Vacancies) in Annexure IV

7. Six cases which were considered and rejected by the earlier CRC were re-examined by the committee in the light of orders of Hon’ble CAT.

i. Case of Shri. Sunil, son of late Shri. Samadhan P. Mahakale, who expired on 02.09.2007 (RE/4-1/31/2010). The case was considered and rejected by the CRC held on 20.04.2011. The applicant filed OA No. 2141/2012 before the Hon’ble CAT, Nagpur Bench. The Hon’ble CAT passed an order dated 10.08.2016 allowing the OA No.2141/2012 and ordered to reconsider the case of the applicant and put up the same before the CRC again as per provision of rules for considering the case for two more years. Accordingly, the case has been considered by the present CRC for scrutiny and comparison with other cases. The candidate is awarded 59 merit points and recommended for selection, listed at sl.no.25 under Annexure III.

ii. Case of Shri. Ravindra R. Bhandawalkar, son of late Shri. Ramchandra K. Bhandawalkar, who expired on 01.10.2010 (RE-4-1/59/2011). The case was considered and rejected by the earlier CRC held on 13.09.2012. The applicant filed OA No.295/2014 before Hon’ble CAT, Mumbai. The said case has been placed before present CRC for reconsideration as per the order dated 05.04.2017 of Hon’ble CAT, Mumbai Bench for scrutiny and comparison with other cases. The candidate is awarded 50 merit points whereas the last selected candidate has 52 points. Accordingly, his case is not recommended and listed at sl.no.25 under Annexure VIII.

iii. Case of Shri. Nikhil, son of late Shri. Prakash W. Nikas, who expired on 07.08.2012 (RE/4-1/39/2013). The case was considered and rejected by the CRC held on 30.12.2013. The applicant filed OA No.211/00245/2015 before the Hon’ble CAT, Nagpur Bench. The Hon’ble CAT passed an order dated 29.09.2016 to reconsider the case of the applicant and ordered to put up the same before the CRC again as per provision of rules for two more years. Accordingly, the case was put up before the present CRC for scrutiny and comparison with other cases. The candidate is awarded only 45 merit points whereas the last selected candidate has 52 points. The committee recommends that the case be submitted to next CRC as the order of Hon’ble CAT is to consider his candidature for 2 years. His case is listed at sl.no.14 under Annexure VII which has cases to be placed before next CRC.

iv. Case of Shri. Haridas, son of late Shri. T.R. Chopade, who expired on 25.08.2002 (RE/4-2/29/ 2005). The case was considered and rejected by the CRC held on 04.11.2006 &
special CRC held on 15.11.2011. The applicant filed OA No.2131/2012 to the Hon’ble CAT, Nagpur Bench. The Hon’ble CAT passed an order dated 10.08.2016 to reconsider the case of the applicant and ordered to put up the same before the CRC again as per provision of rules for two more years. Accordingly, the case has been placed before the present CRC for scrutiny and comparison with other cases. The candidate is awarded 83 merit points and recommended for selection, listed at sl.no.4 under Annexure III.

v. Case of Ms. Pallavi, daughter of late Shri. Prabhakar P. Dhole, who expired on 21.04.2002 (RE/4-2/26/2008). The case was considered and rejected by the CRC held on 10.07.2009. The applicant filed OA No. 211/00140/2016 before the Hon’ble CAT, Nagpur Bench. The Hon’ble CAT passed an order dated 10.07.2016 to reconsider the case of the applicant and ordered to put up the same before the CRC again for reconsideration. Accordingly, the case has been placed before the present CRC for scrutiny and comparison with other cases. The candidate is awarded 89 merit points and recommended for selection, listed at sl.no.3 under Annexure II.

vi. Case of Shri Avinash, son of late Shri. P.G.Meshram who expired on 17.10.2005 (RE/4-4/11/2008). The case was considered and rejected by the CRC held on 13.09.2012. The applicant filed OA No. 211/00061/2016 before the Hon’ble CAT, Nagpur Bench. The Hon’ble CAT passed an order dated 23.11.2017 granting liberty to applicant to file a fresh application for compassionate appointment. Accordingly, the fresh application has been placed before the present CRC for scrutiny and comparison with other cases. The candidate is awarded 53 merit points and recommended for selection, listed at sl.no. 27 under Annexure IV.

8. The applicants who have been recommended by the committee but whose claims are belated i.e. claims submitted with delay of five years from the date of death of ex-official are listed in Annexure-V. Their cases may be taken up with Directorate as per DOPT memo No. F.No.14014/02/z07 dt. 16.01.2013 for relaxation subject to approval of Competent Authority.

9. The committee recommends cases pertaining to the widow applicants who are not fulfilling educational qualifications and listed in Annexure – VI. Approval of competent authority may be obtained in this respect.

10. 18 Cases which have been considered by the CRC but could not be recommended for various reasons (Annexure – VII) are suggested to be examined and considered by next CRC.

   a. 7 Cases in which factor of NPS and pension are not finalized and hence points cannot be accurately awarded.
b. 7 more applications earning 52 points as the last selected candidate having eligible qualification are recommended to be put up before next CRC as per Directorate instructions contained in Memo no.14404/02/2012 Estt(D) dated 30.05.2013.

c. 3 cases in which the original applicants withdrew their claims and requested to consider another family member as mentioned in Para 3 of this minutes.

d. 1 case (case of Shri Nikhil, s/o Late Shri Prakash W. Nikas) not selected due to less merit points should also be placed before the next CRC for one more year as per direction of the Hon’ble CAT.

11. 132 cases which have been rejected by the committee are listed in Annexure-VIII with detailed remarks against the name of each applicant.

(Dr. N Vinod Kumar)
Postmaster General
Goa Region, Panaji
(Chairman)

(Ms. Kalya Arora)
Director of Postal Services
Mumbai Region, Mumbai
(Member)

(Shri Ratan Kumar Dalmia)
Director of Postal Services
Nagpur Region, Nagpur
(Member)